Libraries Scholarship   University Libraries

2020

Is There a Relationship Between Having Residency Application Personal Statements Reviewed by the Library's Editing Service and Medical Students' MATCH into Their Preferred Residency Specialty?

Lisa Price
Rowan University School of Osteopathic Medicine

Jamie L. Pelley

Recommended Citation

Price LM, Pelley JL. Is there a relationship between having residency application personal statements reviewed by the library's editing service and medical students' match into their preferred residency specialty? [Poster 36]. Poster presented at: Vision: The future in focus. MLA 2020 Annual Meeting; 2020 July 27 – Aug 14; Portland, OR.

Rowan University
UNIVERSITY LIBRARIES

Is There a Relationship Between Having Residency Application Personal Statements Reviewed by the Library's Editing Service and Medical Students' MATCH into Their Preferred Residency Specialty?

Lisa M. Price, MSLIS, Rowan University School of Osteopathic Medicine Health Sciences Library
Jamie L. Pelley, MA, MBA

Objective:

- Investigates whether Rowan University School of Osteopathic Medicine's fourth-year students' acceptance into their preferred residency specialty correlates with choosing to use Library's editing service to review/edit the Personal Statement portion of the application
- We hope results will aid other institutions considering whether to provide a similar service

Methods:

- Reviewed Match data for graduation years 2018 and 2019
- Comparison made between used service vs did not use
- 98 of 298 students chose to use
- Anonymized data analysis
  - Pearson correlation analysis
  - logit model: preferred specialty, graduation year, a binary variable indicating service used/not used, dependent variable representing whether matched into preferred specialty
  - Basic correlations between variables

Results:

- Pearson correlation
  - Weak but statistically insignificant overall correlation (.056, p = .337) between Match into Preferred and Reviewed by Library Service
  - Only one specialty category (All Surgery) showed marginal positive correlation at the 10% level (.307, p = .073)
- Logit regression
  - Low increased, but statistically insignificant (Wald χ^2 = 2.070; p = .150), odds of matching if use editing service (1.737:1)
  - Preference of Family Medicine or Internal Medicine the only variables that statistically increased odds of matching
- Although not of statistical significance, interesting to note that 86 of the 98 (87.8%) who used the service matched into preferred specialty

Logit Regression Results for Dependent Variable
Match into Preferred Specialty

Variable	b	χ^{2*}	Sig.	Odds Ratio
Constant	0.603	2.654	.103	1.827
Reviewed by Library Service	0.552	2.070	.150	1.737
Graduation Year	0.460	1.756	.185	1.584
Family Medicine	1.747	5.117	.024	5.740
Internal Medicine	2.459	10.643	.001	11.695
Emergency Medicine	0.454	0.843	.358	1.575
Any Surgery	0.039	0.795	.373	1.040

*Wald chi-square test statistic

		Matched Into Preferred?	Reviewed by Library Service?
Matched Into Preferred?	Pearson Correlation	1	.056
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.337
	N	298	298
Reviewed by Library Service?	Pearson Correlation	.056	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.337	
	N	298	298

Conclusions:

- Little apparent direct correlation between use of editing service and match into preferred specialty.
- Numerous confounding factors, such as
  - Possible editing assistance from alternate or additional sources
  - Prerogative to reject editorial suggestions
  - Preference changes after recording in MSPE
  - Statements bear different weight between specialties and even among a specialty's programs
  - Represents only one part of a complex process
- 2018 NRMP Program Director Survey
  - 78% include Personal Statement among top five considerations for interview decisions
  - Rarely used in final ranking
- Positive effects of editing service (e.g., likelihood of interview) might be mitigated by other factors in final Match results

	Preferred	Matched	Reviewed by Library	Matched Preferred and Reviewed by Library
Psychiatry	17	13	7	6
Family Medicine	36	48	11	11
Internal Medicine	72	81	21	20
Emergency Medicine	38	32	17	14
Pediatrics	25	25	10	9
Anesthesiology	17	17	6	5
General Surgery/Surgery	20	14	8	6
Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation	16	13	1	1
Obstetrics and Gynecology	12	7	5	4
Orthopedic Surgery	15	9	5	4
Neurology	11	11	2	2
Traditional Rotating Internship	1	7	0	0
Diagnostic/Intervention Radiology	7	6	4	3
Other	11	8	1	0
No Match	N/A	7	0	0
Total	**298**	**298**	**98**	**86**

References:

Basehore, Pamela M. "Re: Research proposal request for data." Received by Lisa M. Price. 18 June 2020.

Cardello, Lisa. "RE: please define term." Received by Lisa M. Price. 9 July 2020.

National Resident Matching Program, Data Release and Research Committee: Results of the 2018 NRMP Program Director Survey. National Resident Matching Program, Washington, DC. 2018. PDF accessed at www.nrmp.org/main-residency-match-data/. 15 Jul. 2020.