Impact of Integrated Marketing Communications: from the lens of public relations educators and scholars

Vijaya Singh
Rowan University

Follow this and additional works at: http://rdw.rowan.edu/etd
Part of the Public Relations and Advertising Commons

Recommended Citation
http://rdw.rowan.edu/etd/1082
IMPACT OF INTEGRATED MARKETING COMMUNICATIONS: FROM THE LENS OF PUBLIC RELATIONS EDUCATORS AND SCHOLARS

By
Vijaya Singh

A Thesis

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the Master of Arts Degree of
The Graduate School at
Rowan University (June 1, 2005)

Approved by

Date Approved 11/11/05

© 2005 Vijaya Singh
MINI-ABSTRACT

Vijaya Singh
Impact of Integrated Marketing Communications: From the lens of Public Relations Educators and Scholars
2005
Advisor: Dr. Joseph Basso
Public Relations Graduate Program

The researcher viewed Integrated Marketing Communications through the lens of the Public Relations educators and scholars to determine whether IMC is beneficial or detrimental to the field of public relations. To examine the impact of IMC on public relations education the researcher studied the curricula of 13 graduate programs in public relations and interviewed 15 IMC specialists with public relations background. Findings indicate that most public relations educators and scholars believe the impact of IMC to be beneficial for public relations education.
ABSTRACT

Vijaya Singh
Impact of Integrated Marketing Communications: From the lens of Public Relations Educators and Scholars
2005
Advisor: Dr. Joseph Basso
Public Relations Graduate Program

The researcher viewed Integrated Marketing Communications through the lens of the Public Relations educators and scholars to determine whether IMC is beneficial or detrimental to the field of public relations.

The purpose of this thesis was to explore (a) impact of IMC on public relations education (b) perceived advantages and disadvantages of an IMC approach to a public relations curriculum (c) determine if a need exists to revise public relations education at the university level.

To examine the impact of IMC on public relations education the researcher conducted a formal quantitative content analysis of the curricula of 13 graduate programs in public relations to determine if other marketing elements such as direct marketing, advertising and sales promotion are included in the coursework. In addition, the researcher used qualitative research in the form of interviews with 15 IMC specialists who have a public relations background to gain an in-depth understanding of the educators’ point of view on IMC and their perceptions of its implications on public relations education.

Findings indicate that most public relations educators and scholars believe the impact of IMC to be beneficial for public relations education.
# Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction ........................................................... 1

Chapter 2: Review of the Literature........................................... 10
  Debate over Integrated Marketing Communications.................. 11
  Practical Applications....................................................... 25
  Implications for Scholars and Practitioners.......................... 31
  Task Force on Integrated Communications 1993..................... 35
  IMC Study 1995................................................................. 37
  Designing the IMC course................................................... 39
  Conclusions......................................................................... 47

Chapter 3: Research Design....................................................... 48

Chapter 4: Results.................................................................. 51
  Survey................................................................................ 50
  Content Analysis............................................................... 57

Chapter 5: Discussion............................................................. 61
  Limitations of the study..................................................... 61
Possible new directions for public relations educators and scholars...........62

References........................................................................................................64

Appendix A: Five-item Questionnaire..............................................................66

Appendix B: IMC Coursework Model..............................................................67
List of Tables

Task Force’s Proposed Integrated Communication Curriculum..................38

Two Conceptual Models of Integrated Curriculum.................................42

1996-99 Advertising & Public Relations Graduate Employer Survey...........46

1996-99 Advertising & Public Relations Graduate Job Description Survey....46

Model for an Integrated Curriculum....................................................57
Integrated Marketing Communications (IMC) combines different communication instruments such as promotion, public relations, sales promotion, personal selling and Internet communication to reach a company's target audience.

According to the AEJMC conference paper, The Interdisciplinary debate over IMC, “During the 1990s, business sought to foster relationships with the public through IMC. IMC is the practice of coordinating messages from advertising, sales promotion, direct response and public relations. Traditionally, marketing and public relations departments kept their activities separate, maintaining distinct roles and operating in different branches of an organization. IMC, however, offered the opportunity for coordination between departments. For example, where public relations promotes retail stores by issuing news releases or staging special events, which place products in prominent view of consumers, marketing may support public relations by developing products or packaging, which reinforces the company image.”

Therefore, IMC incorporates unique public relations and marketing approaches that create and establish integrity and credibility through media relations coupled with the integration of customized marketing programs to achieve strategic objectives.

1 AEJMC conference paper, The Interdisciplinary debate over IMC, 1998
IMC’s innovative three-step approach can best be described as follows:

I. Complete Understanding of the Product and/or Services Relating to:
   - Strategic Direction
   - Branding and Image
   - Corporate Positioning
   - Public Affairs
   - Issues Management

II. Aggressive Approach to:
   - Media Relations
   - Internal Communications
   - Marketing
   - Community Relations

III. Accountability — Approach to Achieve Client’s Objectives:
   - Bottom Line
   - Image
   - Branding
   - Corporate Positioning
   - Media Visibility
   - Sales Support
   - Crisis Communications
   - Promotions and Events

Definition of Integrated Marketing Communications

Several scholars have offered a definition of IMC. For the purpose of this study, the researcher used the definition from the American Association of Advertising.

---

\(^2\) www.imcomm.net
Agencies. IMC is defined as "a concept of marketing communications planning that recognizes the added value of a comprehensive plan that evaluates the strategic roles of a variety of communication disciplines--for example, general advertising, direct response, sales promotion, and public relations--and combines these disciplines to provide clarity, consistency, and maximum communications impact."³

Don Schultz (1993), professor of Advertising and Direct Marketing at Northwestern University's Medill School of Journalism and president of Agora Inc., Evanston, Ill, authored Integrated Marketing Communications. Schultz stresses that IMC requires a big picture approach to planning communication programs, and it should involve all sources of brand or company contact that a customer or prospect has with a product or service. Consumers develop their perception of a company by synthesizing the bundle of messages received through vehicles such as advertisements, price, publicity, direct marketing, and retail environments.

Tom Duncan (1994), director of the new IMC program at the University of Denver, Colorado, interprets IMC as "selling with a consistent voice and look, while emphasizing interactivity as the key to relationship building."⁴

Taken as a whole, scholars appear to agree that IMC combines coordination of activities, strategic planning and consistent messaging.

Shift in Trends

Several factors have spurred the trend toward IMC. According to Belch & Belch, "Many companies have begun shifting marketing dollars away from mass media

---

³ AEJMC conference paper, The Interdisciplinary debate over IMC, 1998
⁴ Ibid
advertising, claiming that traditional media has become too expensive and is ineffective. Additionally, audiences are more segmented and sophisticated in their reaction to advertising, so marketers are turning to alternative approaches like special events promotion, direct mail, and database marketing. Another major reason for the move toward IMC is that companies, in the ongoing climate of downsizing, attempt to economize and maximize personnel efforts.\(^5\) Schultz believes that “there is the increasing capability of technology that has led to the move toward IMC.”\(^6\) While IMC represents an opportunity to some, to others it poses a threat. Some scholars raised the issue of “imperialism,” concerned that one department may seek to dominate another.

Clearly a difference of opinion exists, in the perception of IMC. This difference of opinion is most evident in public relations.

Although public relations plays an integral role in an IMC program, many educators and scholars appear reluctant to take a strategic view of the implications of IMC on public relations education. The question most frequently asked is what does public relations gain from integration? Perhaps, a better question would be, can public relations educators afford to ignore the critical need to broaden the horizons of a public relations education, and incorporate more emphasis on IMC?

Problem

According to a study that appeared in Journalism & Mass Communication educator in 1998, “Public relations students often question their preparedness for employment. It has been felt that those educators are somehow failing to train effective, job-ready communicators. Most of today’s public relations graduates do not join

\(^5\) Ibid
\(^6\) Ibid
agencies but work as communication specialists where staffing and budget constraints may require them to perform multiple functions. In this context a clear-cut demarcation between major communications disciplines such as advertising, direct marketing, sales promotion, internet marketing, and public relations appears to limit most public relations majors. The change brought by IMC suggests a need for a corresponding change in preparing students for the work force. As such, a need may exist to rethink traditional public relations education and focus more on an integrated approach.”

Some educators are questioning whether public relations sequences are falling behind expectations and if there is a need to look at current public relations curriculum. However, research shows that some public relations educators express concern that merging the various components of marketing into the public relations education system may impair a student’s ability to become fluent in any single discipline. Therefore, the primary purpose addressed in this study is ascertaining whether a majority of the public relations educators/scholars view integrating courses beneficial or detrimental to the education of public relations.

Purpose

In the introduction to their book, Marketing Communications: Integrated Theory, Strategy and Tactics, authors James G. Hutton and Francis J. Mulhern (2002) make the point that “marketing communications is undergoing dizzying changes because of new communication technologies, fragmentation of the mass media, new market segmentation

---

7 Journalism & mass communication educator, Impact of IMC on advertising and public relations education, Vol.53, No.2,1998
Furthermore, management expert Peter Drucker opined that marketing is so basic it cannot be considered a separate function. Drucker writes, "Marketing is the whole business from the point of view of its final result; that is from the customer's point of view."9

Don Frischmann, IBM communications operations director believes that public relations and marketing are inextricably linked. According to Frischmann, "Management is looking for public relations to make a difference where it counts, on the bottom line." He adds, "We're communicators and PR people, not marketers, but the company sells and we better be part of the process. If we can sell products though what was once a major expense item, we can find ways to demonstrate the effectiveness of PR."10

The purpose of this thesis was to explore the following elements about IMC as a component of a public relations curriculum at a university. In particular the researcher addressed four questions.

1) What is the impact of IMC on public relations education?

2) What are the perceived advantages and disadvantages of an IMC approach to a public relations curriculum?

3) Does a need exist to revise public relations education at the university level in light of literature on IMC?

4) Does a solution exist for reconciling the different opinions for implementing an IMC approach into an existing public relations curriculum?

---

10 Ibid
Results from this study will help develop specific recommendations for implementing programs and ideas for public relations scholars and educators in developing an IMC program.

Procedure

According to research done by Rose & Miller in 1993, “IMC finds stronger opposition among public relations faculty than among faculty in other communication disciplines. Many in public relations believe that their discipline is not a marketing function but a broader entity that cannot be wholly represented in IMC. The public relations practitioner most often acts as a counselor (instead of a salesperson), whose primary function is to maintain internal and external relationships.”

Lauzen writes, “the idea that public relations has little or nothing to do with marketing is prompting some public relations educators to characterize marketing as an imperialist encroachment upon their field.”

Some see little cause for concern. According to Harris, “If public relations can demonstrate its effectiveness, it’s difficult to fathom the near hysteria expressed in some public relations circles about an attempted take-over of the public relations function by marketing.”

A 1991 study surveying members of Public Relations Society of America, the American Advertising Federation (AAF) and the International Association of Business Communicators (IABC) concluded that, “educators should revisit and reshape the present curriculum at the graduate level to reflect the advanced training needs identified by the

\[11\text{bid}\]
\[12\text{Ibid}\]
\[13\text{Ibid}\]
Whatever the approach, there is one recurring thought that must be addressed: change is here and communication functions are becoming more interrelated. Therefore, the researcher offered comprehensive view of the coursework offered currently at the graduate level to understand whether the public relations educators have confirmed to the requirements of the changing communications industry.

Terminology

The following terms were used to understand the problem, purpose and recommendations.

**Content Analysis** - A method of analysis used in qualitative research in which the text is systematically examined by identifying and grouping themes and coding, classifying and developing categories.

**Components of IMC** - The five main components of integrated marketing communications are advertising, sales promotion, direct marketing, Internet marketing and public relations. The effective and judicious use of these channels in conveying this message is known as Integrated Marketing Communications (IMC).

**Public Relations** - The management function that evaluates stakeholder attitudes, changes policies and procedures in response to stakeholder requests, and execute programs of action and information to earn public understanding and acceptance.

**Advertising** – The non-personal communication of information, usually paid for, and usually persuasive in nature, about products, services or ideas by identified sponsors through the various media.

**Direct Marketing** - Any direct communication to a consumer or business recipient that

---

14 Ibid
is designed to generate a response in the form of an order, a request for further information, and/or a visit to a store or other place of business for purchase of a specific product(s) or service(s).

Curricula – A plan of instruction that details what students are to know, how they are to learn it, what the teacher's role is, and the context in which learning and teaching will take place.

PR educators/scholars – People involved in teaching public relations students and building the body of knowledge in public relations by conducting public relations research.

Sales Promotion - An activity or material that acts as a direct inducement by offering added value to, or incentive for, the product to resellers, salespeople or consumers

Internet marketing - Strategies and techniques applied on the Internet to support the organization's overall online marketing objectives. Goals may include driving targeted traffic to a Website and features on the Website to create a desired call to action. Internet marketing may include keyword and Meta tag strategies, newsgroup and mailing list postings, banner advertising, reciprocal links, online promotions, content positioning, online image development, email strategies and other interactive features.

Media relations – Building strong relationships with reporters in a community and industry to develop positive, ongoing public relations for an organization.
Chapter 2
Review of the Literature

Several scholars have offered a definition of IMC. The American Association of Advertising Agencies defines IMC as "a concept of marketing communications planning that recognizes the added value of a comprehensive plan that evaluates the strategic roles of a variety communication disciplines—for example, general advertising, direct response, sales promotion, and public relations—and combines these disciplines to provide clarity, consistency, and maximum communications impact."\(^{15}\)

Schultz stressed that IMC requires a *big picture* approach to planning communication programs, and should involve all sources of brand or company contact that a customer or prospect has with a product or service. Schultz says, "Consumers develop their perception of a company by synthesizing the bundle of messages received through vehicles such as advertisements, price, publicity, direct marketing, and the retail environments offering the product."\(^{16}\) Duncan defined IMC as "selling with a consistent voice and look, while emphasizing interactivity as the key to relationship-building."\(^{17}\)

\(^{15}\) AEJMC conference papers, Central Michigan University - The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, 1998
\(^{16}\) Ibid
\(^{17}\) Ibid
Debate over integrated marketing communications

Is IMC a win-win strategy for organizations, or is it simply a turf battle between public relations and marketing? Scholars and professionals from the communication, marketing and advertising professions have probed the benefits of IMC. Others have bypassed the debate, to describe practical applications and implementation strategies, which achieve integrated communication and marketing objectives.

Lauzen in his conference paper, The Interdisciplinary Debate over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, identified the dangers of integration from the public relations viewpoint. As a result of perceived power differences, turf wars often develop with one department intruding on the activities held in the domain of the other. Termed *imperialism* this behavior has important consequences for public relations. In the study Lauzen argued “when marketing overlaps activity with public relations, marketing tends to encroach on public relations by taking over management of the department.”

Lauzen also found that marketing imperialism led to encroachment on public relations. He asserted, “public relations departments which operate with a vacuum of power are likely to experience imperialism from multiple departments simultaneously.” Lauzen adds, “public relations departments are susceptible to imperialism by marketing, legal, personnel, and human resource development departments.” Defining imperialism as the takeover or overlap of activities traditionally done by one department he indicated, “public relations is vulnerable to imperialism by the marketing department. Marketing is

---

18 Ibid
perceived as a company’s least substitutable function. Also, marketers have actively tried to incorporate public relations into their practice.\textsuperscript{19}

Scholars have developed concepts like megamarketing, whereby marketers add power and public relations to their traditional focus of product, price, place and promotion. Marketers recommend using public relations practitioners to plan and implement mega marketing programs, thereby assuming public relations under their auspices.

In another example, advertisers promote The New Advertising as the practice of integrating media advertising with sales promotion, direct marketing, product design, public relations, and directory advertising.

Lauzen contends, “public relations is vulnerable to imperialism by the legal department. Legal and public relations functions overlap when there are labor contract negotiations or other legal or publicly explosive situations. Some examples are when an organization faces an antitrust suit, campus uprising, boycott threat, accusation of discrimination, or military court-martial. Legal departments may increasingly claim the public relations role as its own domain, threatening the management autonomy of public relations.”\textsuperscript{20}

According to Lauzen, “public relations is also vulnerable to imperialism by the personnel department. Personnel overlaps with public relations because employees are considered a public of public relations. Personnel’s domain may include employee suggestion systems, bulletin boards, new employee orientation, exit interviews, and

\textsuperscript{19} Lauzen, M- Imperialism and encroachment in public relations - Public Relations Review, 1991: 245-255
\textsuperscript{20} Ibid
recruitment programs. Public relations' domain typically includes annual reports, open
houses, news releases on labor negotiations, and maintenance of biographical data on key
employees.”

Both public relations and personnel may be responsible for employee
publications, employee newsletters, and conducting career days. As personnel
departments become more familiar with public relations activities, the threat exists that
personnel could be viewed as the expert.

“Human resources development is another area prone to imperialism over public
relations”, suggests Lauzen. He adds, “Human resources and organizational development
departments are responsible for maintaining organizational relationships, aspects of
employee communication, writing reports, speeches and articles, and communication
with government and community agencies. These activities are potentially shared
domain with public relations.”

Lauzen found that only marketing imperialism evolves into encroachment. She
found the encroachment occurs when top management promotes, transfers, or hires
someone from another profession to manage the public relations department. According
to Lauzen, “further research should assess whether imperialistic departments are targeting
managerial or technical public relations activities, and whether encroachment increases
the more a domain is shared by two departments.”

Ibid
Ibid
Ibid

13
Also writing from the communication perspective, Moriarty (1994) argues “public relations makes valuable contributions to IMC and can use principles of IMC to improve its practice.” She posits, “IMC is an amalgamation of many disciplines and has become a new field with independent theories and practices.” Moriarty contends “IMC planners view every contact point between an organization and its stakeholders as a communication opportunity.”

Moriarty presents an IMC Message Typology model, stating, “An organization must be able to influence four types of messages. The four messages are planned, inferred, maintenance, and unplanned. Planned messages are deliberate communication activities such as advertising, packaging and public relations. Inferred messages are created by the impressions a company makes on people, for example, through product pricing and employee benefits. Maintenance messages are communicated through customer service and employee relations. Unplanned messages include media investigations, product recalls, disasters, and issues management.”

According to Moriarty, “a new organizational structure must be designed to oversee all four message types. Public relations is challenged because many communications are controlled by other departments including marketing, human resources, and finance. Cross-functional teams may be a solution to managing communication across departments, or one person should monitor all unplanned communications.”

---

24 Moriarty, S- PR and IMC: the benefits of integration. Public Relations Quarterly: 38-44
25 Ibid
26 Ibid
Moriarty describes an IMC Synergy model, which integrates an organization’s communication messages via three components. He says, “The goal of the Synergy model is for the sum of an organization’s messages to create a greater impact than the individual messages by themselves. The first component is that messages must be consistent despite the diversity of audiences. Message consistency should occur in advertising and promotion as well as in customer service, employee programs and business communications. The second component is interactivity with audiences. Technology is creating new two-way communication systems with a variety of stakeholders. The third component of message synergy is to have a clear organizational mission, which explains what the company stands for beyond products and sales.”

According to Moriarty, “a mission invites commitment from stakeholders, and motivates employees and investors to feel good about the company. A mission influences an organization’s long-range planning, and permeates communications and corporate culture. Mission strategy calls for a change agent specialist, and that is an opportunity for public relations or corporate communications managers to extend their sphere and make an important contribution to the organization.”

Moriarty believes that, “Public relations practitioners may be instrumental in mission development and buy-in since they have the knowledge to nurture relationships, motivate people, and elicit behavior change.”

Moriarty recommends Zero Based Planning as a process for IMC. Zero Based Planning occurs when an organization conducts annual evaluations of the company’s

---

27 Ibid
28 Ibid
29 Ibid
communication objectives, and allocates a budget and resources to the communication area, which can best deliver success. By clearing departmental budgets to zero each year, all the communication areas start planning on equal footing. If one area is chosen to dominate in message dissemination, then other departments provide support to reinforce the message. Moriarty opines, “During Zero Based Planning, public relations can be instrumental in determining target audiences, message crafting, and timing of the communication strategy. Communication audits and consumer behavior research are also parts of IMC planning.”

Moriarty also contends “IMC requires leaders with cross-discipline management skills, knowledge of marketing strategy, appreciation for the contributions of all departments, and leadership ability. Public relations practitioners are well suited to play a role as change agents for an organization and as experts on relationships, motivation and involvement. Through this knowledge, public relations has much to contribute to IMC.”

Advertising scholars advocate for IMC. Belch and Belch argue, “public relations, publicity, and corporate advertising should be integrated into the promotional mix to market products more effectively.”

They add, “while these three components are typically used to change public attitudes and not to sell products, they should be coordinated with marketing as a way of preventing miscommunication.” Belch and Belch highlight several benefits to public relations collaborating with marketing. Belch and Belch write, “traditional public relations tactics are useful to marketing because they raise awareness by informing and

---

30 Ibid
31 Ibid
32 Belch, G.and Belch, M- Public relations, publicity, and corporate advertising. In Introduction to advertising and promotion-3rd edition, 1995: 516-547
educating. They also help build trust, motivate consumer acceptance, and give consumers a reason to buy. Benefits of public relations activities for marketing include building consumer excitement before media advertising breaks. A second benefit is creating advertising news where there is no product news. A third benefit is introducing a product with little or no advertising. A fourth benefit is providing a value-added service to customers. A fifth benefit is building brand-to-customer bonds. A sixth benefit is influencing opinion leaders by providing them with information. A seventh benefit is defending products at risk.”

Belch and Belch state that “a barrier of public relations is the problem of clearly linking public relations’ efforts to the organization in the public’s mind. Because of the challenge, public relations should be evaluated in order to demonstrate its achievements to management.” They recommend publicity, a subset of public relations, as another promotional tool. They view publicity as a short-term strategy, and public relations as a long-term strategy. They believe “publicity also differs from public relations because coverage about the organization by the media may be negative or is less easily controlled, whereas public relations messages are always positive.”

A drawback to publicity is that the planner cannot control the timing or accuracy of the news release. Corporate advertising, according to Belch and Belch, “is another promotional strategy which shapes an organization’s image while positioning it in the marketplace. General advertisements and sponsorships may be used to recruit investors or employees. Advocacy advertising is used to state a company’s position on a social issue.

33 Ibid
34 Ibid
Cause-related marketing is yet another method, which links companies with charities or nonprofits. A benefit of corporate advertising is that it reliably gets a message out, whereas publicity is not guaranteed through public relations. Problems with corporate advertising are that few studies prove it actually works, and the public may distrust it because they see the strategy used only by large companies who can afford it.\textsuperscript{36}

Belch and Belch say, “public relations, publicity, and corporate advertising are all promotional elements which help achieve marketing objectives. These three areas differ from marketing, however, because the consumer cannot clearly make the connection between the message and the source. Public relations, publicity and corporate advertising are also unique because they do not promote a specific product or service.”\textsuperscript{37}

From the marketing perspective, Stewart (1996) contends “IMC is ineffective because it remains an ill-defined and ambiguous concept based on several inaccurate assumptions.” Stewart argues, “Organizations should use a market-back approach when designing IMC programs. A market-back approach results in programs which are based on consumer feedback and are constantly evolving.” Stewart asserts, “IMC has been adopted by many organizations, but each is defining it differently.”\textsuperscript{38}

Stewart states the issue of IMC is “what requires coordination, then, is not just the communication function, but the business.” He warns “merely coordinating the communications function may not succeed,” citing Polaroid staff’s resistance to change and several advertising agencies, which dismantled their integrative services in the 1990s.

\textsuperscript{36} Ibid
\textsuperscript{37} Ibid
\textsuperscript{38} Stewart, D- Market-back approach to the design of integrated communications program: a change in paradigm and focus on determinants of success. Journal of Business Research, 1996: 147-153
In Stewart’s view, “IMC has become an ideal that is proving difficult to implement.” Stewart argues “IMC has been unsuccessful because organizations make four inaccurate assumptions. The first assumption is that organization-wide change is best. In the context of IMC, this has not worked because organizational structural changes do not automatically change behavior. In fact, they often foster resistance to change, because the changes are not owned by those asked to alter their behavior.”

In his study Stewart suggests that “IMC should focus on putting communications personnel into new situations where they are can establish relationships with customers and other departments. Relationship building will reap better results than a more formal integration in the organization.” Stewart states “IMC’s second inaccurate assumption is that formalized organizational coordination creates positive synergy.”

To the contrary, Stewart cites evidence that “organizations who formally try to coordinate functions have actually produced negative synergy.” His research also shows that negative synergy, known as X-inefficiency in economics, is found less in workers who are closely tied to customers and are aware of how change in the market affects their own and their firm’s well being.

Therefore, Stewart suggests, “communications should become more of a line-function in organizations, so that those communicating have more familiarity with all the company practices as well as a first-hand understanding of the customer.”

39 Ibid
40 Ibid
41 Ibid
42 Ibid
Stewart's describes IMC's third inaccurate assumption as the "idea that marketing communications can be managed separately from the rest of the business. Communications is added too often as an afterthought once the products are planned and produced. Instead, Stewart argues that marketing communications should be involved early and throughout product design and delivery, and that communications professionals must understand the firm, its products and services, and its business strategy. These skills are typical more of a general manager, rather than a functional specialist."  

Stewart defines IMC's fourth inaccurate assumption as "the notion that marketing communication is a powerful force on consumers."  

Stewart argues that the "era is finished, and that with increasing media alternatives like the computer, consumers are better able to hide and seek information anonymously." He adds, "Consumers will become addressable only to the extent they want to be, whereas the companies are more easily addressed by the consumers. Therefore, communications should not be about controlling messages to the consumer, but helping consumers find the information they need, at their convenience and in their own preferred form. Marketers may manage and coordinate, but they cannot make consumers process communications. To counter these assumptions, Stewart recommends using a market-back approach to design successful IMC programs."  

According to Stewart, "The market-back approach is based on four principles. The first principle is that value for the customer should be analyzed and the primary goal of communications is to add value, not to influence consumers. The second principle is

---

43 Ibid
44 Ibid
that planners should not replicate successful programs from the past but should constantly learn new solutions. The third principle is to use a bottom-up strategy, where employees closest to implementing the strategies with the customer provide creative solutions and generate better buy-in. The fourth principle is that continuous feedback from the market should influence structures, systems procedures and information flows with the goal of adding value to the customer.”  

The market-back approach to IMC suggests that IMC will be most successful when it accepts the dominant role of the consumer in the flow and control of information.

According to Stewart, “a market-back approach to IMC has significant organizational implications. Communications design and implementation must be carried out closer to the customer by individuals who understand how the firm delivers value to its customers. This requires a more decentralized approach.”

He believes that, “Research is currently dominated by measuring customer response to communications. Instead it should observe how communications can reply to customers and add value, by measuring what customer’s preferred models are for obtaining information and how they relate to their goals and purposes.”

According to Schultz, “the IMC debate is moot because integrated communication is inevitable. He cites two major forces driving integrated communications. The first is the changing concepts of advertising. The second is the shift of information technology in the marketplace. Information technology helped evolve the

---

46 Ibid

48AEJMC conference papers, Central Michigan University - The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, 1998
Historical Marketplace to the New Marketplace and towards the "21st Century Marketplace." 49

Schultz adds, "The mass production model of advertising is evolving into a one-to-one model. Historically, mass media advertising created singular messages about a product to consumers. Mass media advertisers assumed that consumers were all the same, and crafted their message to differentiate their product rather than the audience. Similarly, products were distributed in a linear one-way process, moving from the producer to wholesaler to retailer to consumer. Therefore the manufacturer or marketer dominated the distribution system." 50

Schultz asserts, "Technology has revolutionized how advertising is evaluated. Historically advertising was evaluated using models evolved from the Hierarchy of Effects, which depicted consumers as passive players in the purchasing process. These models were linear and one-way, while communication messages were acted on consumers. Most of the research measured consumers’ attitudes rather than their actual behavior." 51

"Now though, tools such as Universal Product Code bar coding and Point of Purchase systems are used on products in almost every retail location. By linking consumer purchases through these systems, consumer behavior becomes an actual measurable unit. Individual consumers also become identifiable, turning marketing communications into a closed-loop system rather than a linear one-way system. Scanner

50 Ibid
51 Ibid
data has replaced the old ways of conducting evaluations, with a focus on behavioral data rather than on attitudes."^{52}

Schultz also contends that “current marketing communication research is flawed because researchers break down the communication process into small parts. Hence, trying to isolate and study the role of public relations or sales promotion is impractical, because purchasing situations are extremely complex.” In today’s interconnected world, Schultz believes promotion occurs at all levels. Accordingly, “it is unrealistic to create uncontaminated situations where one singular communication element, such as advertising, can be studied in isolation. Instead advertising and other communication strategies must be considered holistically, and in combination with each other, as activities which influence consumers.”^{53}

Schultz contends “information technology moved from the Historical Marketplace to the New Marketplace, and now toward the 21st Century Marketplace. In the Historical Marketplace, manufacturers or marketers dominated the system because they controlled all the resources of the marketplace. These resources included money, raw materials, plants and equipment, and information. Because the manufacturer controlled the information technology, it controlled the marketplace until the 1970s.”^{54}

According to AEJMC conference papers, Central Michigan University - The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, “During the New Marketplace in the 1970s, retail and distribution organizations consolidated and merged into cooperatives. Using the new scanning

^{52} AEJMC conference papers, Central Michigan University - The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, 1998
^{54} Ibid
technology, retailers gained valuable information about their customers and the
marketplace. Retailers began controlling the marketplace—including the manufacturer,
consumer and communication media—because they held the important consumer
information.\textsuperscript{55}

Schultz contends, “Information technology is now shifting to the consumer of the
21st Century Marketplace. In this scenario, the consumer communicates and purchases
through the media with the retailer and manufacturer on an interactive basis. Typically
the consumer requests information, and the retailer and manufacturer send messages. The
consumer is active in the marketplace. For example, a consumer can shop for a camera at
many retail stores to collect information, and then purchase through a less expensive
distributor using technology such as the telephone and credit card. Schultz describes the
communication flow of the 21st Century Marketplace as an outside-in flow.\textsuperscript{56}

Traditionally, communication flowed inside-out, meaning the marketing
organization sent messages out to prospective consumers. With the outside-in scenario,
consumers access the information they need. Therefore, senders become receivers, while
receivers become senders. The market is interactive and communication flows in both
directions. Furthermore, the consumer may seek information not only from marketers but
also from other sources including consumer reports and press reviews.

“Debating the merits of IMC is pointless, because integration occurs whether the
marketer or advertiser plans it or not.” Instead Schultz asks “whether the consumer’s
process of integrating messages is helpful or harmful to marketing objectives.” He

\textsuperscript{55} AEJMC conference papers, Central Michigan University - The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC:
Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, 1998
\textsuperscript{56} Schultz, D- Journal of Business Research, Inevitability of integrated communications, 1996: 130-146
contends, “Marketing communications managers must try to manage all the information sources which might influence a consumer, and respond to consumer requests for additional information. As messages become shaped by requests from prospective customers, the drive for integrated communications becomes necessary and inevitable.”

Practical applications

While scholars probe the merits of IMC, practitioners in marketing, advertising and public relations have been actually implementing the strategies. For example, Lawrence cites the example of Southwest Airlines in Advertising Age. Integrated mix makes expansion fly: PR program leads Southwest foray into east coast, which was effective in using an integrated communications mix to enter new markets on the east coast. Southwest combined advertising, community relations, public relations, special events, direct marketing, and government relations to introduce itself to the Baltimore area. Southwest first conducted research into key issues that are important to the Baltimore community.

The planners centered much of their public communication around a baseball theme, which is a favorite Baltimore activity. Five weeks before the first flight, they held a press conference featuring the Maryland governor and Southwest chairman. The two leaders exchanged gifts of Maryland products and a Southwest water flotation device, described as a lifesaver from high fares. The goal of the public relations activities was to incorporate Southwest into the community before it operated its first flight.

57 Ibid
After entering the market, Southwest continued conducting public relations activities around baseball. To promote a new route between Baltimore and Cleveland, Southwest sponsored 49 children to fly to the Cleveland Metro parks Zoo. Many complementary strategies were used to introduce Southwest to Baltimore. Southwest sent a direct mail piece to short-trip travelers in Baltimore, inviting them to join its frequent flyer campaign. They also used promotions as a strategy by passing out fliers and peanuts on Baltimore streets. Finally, they placed ads in the Washington Post to encourage Washingtonians to fly out of Baltimore on Southwest.

According to Lawrence, "Southwest's integrated marketing approach succeeded because advertising people were able to appreciate the value of public relations. Advertising was employed as a follow-up strategy to reinforce messages already created by public relations. Southwest continues its integrated marketing approach, by maintaining an area-marketing manager and staff to plan local promotions and events. Integrated marketing strategies proved successful for Southwest in Baltimore, which set a company record for advanced bookings before the start of service."58

Warner also cites case examples to argue, "Companies can effectively combine advertising and public relations to position product brands in the market." According to Warner, "advertising agencies must stop regarding public relations as an inferior value-added service and more as a full-fledged marketing partner."59

58 Lawrence, J- Advertising Age. Integrated mix makes expansion fly: PR program leads Southwest foray into east coast, Nov. 8, 1993: 64
59 Warner, C- Public Relations Journal, Applying integrated marketing to brand positioning, 1992: 48, 15-16
“Companies may use multidisciplinary teams representing advertising, public relations, media, research and the client who strategizes the most effective brand position, regardless of which department takes the lead.”

According to AEJMC Conference paper titled ‘The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators,’ “Knowledge from each area of expertise goes into the evaluation of the client’s budget, goals, and personality.”

Warner writes, “guerrilla marketing, a form of product sampling, is one strategy to generate consumer interest in a product. In fact Smartfood Popcorn used guerrilla-marketing tactics, by employing college students to dress up as human popcorn bags and distribute samples. The students were sent to youth-oriented locations such as ski slopes, beaches, sporting events, concerts and college campuses. Smartfood also launched a wacky, hip advertising campaign. Both the product sampling strategy and the advertisements generated press coverage and increased sales.”

Warner asserts, “public relations and advertising strategies may also be used jointly to reposition a brand against competing products.” He cites an example of Veryfine Products, a juice company that wanted to reposition itself against the soda industry. The company used billboard advertising to promote the anti-carbonation revolution. They also used public relations strategies, hiring local professional actors to portray anti-carbonation crusaders. These Burp Busters provided entertainment at public events while handing out Veryfine samples. Additionally, public relations planned an
instant-win sweepstakes, with a Carbonation Vacation in Florida. Veryfine's use of advertising and public relations resulted in increases in sales, brand awareness and brand preference.

Integrated strategies may also be used to expand a brand to reflect its corporate image. One of the other examples cited by Warner, The Timberland Company sought to expand its Great Outdoors reputation for quality shoes, clothing and accessories. It used advertising with the tag line ‘Boots, shoes, clothes, wind, water, earth and sky.’ Concurrently, it used public relations tactics by collaborating with The Wilderness Society on educational and lobbying activities. Timberland sponsored a touring photography exhibit, published an action guide on saving ancient forests, and produced a new corporate magazine entitled Elements: The Journal of Outdoor Experience. Timberland also sponsored the Iditarod, a grueling dogsled race in Alaska. By publicizing the Iditarod through video news releases, Timberland increased audience viewership of the race.

Additionally, Timberland developed a new apparel line entitled the Iditarod Collection. Combining advertising with several creative public relations strategies, Timberland increased its sales by 111% and has expanded internationally.

As another practical approach, Englis and Solomon propose using consumption constellations in the development of IMC strategies. "A consumption constellation is a cluster of complementary products, brands, or consumption activities which signify a certain social role. Through consumption clusters laden with symbolic meaning,
consumers can communicate their affiliation with a positively valued or aspirational cultural category (a reference group, idealized lifestyle, etc.) and its attendant values.\[63\]

Like Moriarty, Englis and Solomon write, “IMC planners need to manage every point of contact between the consumer and the product or organization. Planners must identify the best times and situations where marketing communications will reach different target audiences. Planners can enhance message acceptance by learning the preexisting context of certain products in the minds of audience.”\[64\]

Englis and Solomon contend that “consumers create consumption constellations by associating certain products with those from other categories. People make these cross-category associations because of functional complementarity, aesthetic complementarity, or sociocultural complementarity. Functional complementarity occurs if products can be consumed jointly to facilitate an activity, such as combining athletic shoes and a different brand of balls to play tennis. Aesthetic complementarity occurs if different products have pleasing or attractive relationships with each other, such as modern furniture in a modern house. Socio-cultural complementarity occurs when people use distinctive groupings of products or activities to express different social identities.”\[65\]

Englis and Solomon present three strategic domains for using consumption constellations in integrated communications. Communicators may convey lifestyle messages through environmental positioning, endorsement, and product ensembles. The first domain they cite “is placing products in certain environmental niches which resonate with the customer and show the product’s use. The social category of a product may be

\[64\] Ibid
\[65\] Ibid
reinforced through an advertisement’s scene or set design. Sponsored events also contextualize products in an environment, since the social aspects of the event create associations to the company. Lastly, marketers create environmental niches by designing environments where people come into contact with the products or perhaps observe consumption of the products.  

Carefully engineered retail stores, like Niketown in Chicago and Ralph Lauren in Manhattan, have created distinct images about products. “Planners may position products through a second domain defined as endorsement. A distinct celebrity or social type conveys associations for a product. Another example of endorsement is the use of media plugs generated by public relations. Yet another type of endorsement is product placements in the movies, where viewers link a consumption activity with the lifestyle and personality of the character. Finally, the third domain for consumption constellations is presenting products as parts of ensembles. This may be done through merchandising decisions, where certain brands are grouped together in marketing materials or advertising.”

Englis and Solomon argue, “Marketers must coordinate media decisions to convey lifestyle imagery in traditional and emerging media forms. Planners should use consumption constellations in the strategic planning for IMC.”

---

66 Ibid
67 AEJMC conference papers, Central Michigan University - The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, 1998
68 Ibid
Implications for scholars and practitioners

Several implications from the debate over IMC are noteworthy for public relations practitioners. A study by Schultz and Stewart that is included in the AEJMC conference paper in 1998, clearly demonstrates the contributions of public relations toward achieving marketing objectives. According to the study, “Public relations practitioners have many skills to help create the interactive, consumer-driven workplace of the future because of their innate expertise in researching audiences, learning consumer attitudes and needs, and fostering systems of audience feedback. Clearly public relations play a valuable role in IMC.” The study asks an important question, “What does public relations gain from integration?” This appears to be the central question for public relations practitioners and scholars alike.

According to Stewart, “One benefit is that public relations efforts may not necessarily be diluted by competing messages from another department in the organization. To the contrary, through IMC, public relations messages can be reinforced by other departments. This improves the chances that the target audience will receive and correctly synthesize the desired message. Another benefit is that integrated communications uses organizational resources efficiently and with synergistic results.”

“Finally, Public Relations has the potential to become more prominent in all customer-based communication, and not exclusively the traditional public relations activities. Another major implication of the IMC debate is the extent to which integration should occur within an organization. Organizational changes are cumbersome and do not guarantee behavior changes,” he adds.

69 Ibid
70 Ibid
Moriarty and Warner in their studies have proposed several strategic methods for IMC collaboration including zero based planning, mission development and strategic planning, and interdisciplinary brand teams. These methods do not require radical changes in the structure of the organization; however, they do involve public relations in collaborative processes that help achieve overall organizational goals.

According to the AEJMC conference papers, The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, "Organizations can also foster integration by positioning communication specialists closer to the consumer, and by motivating all employees to communicate a consistent message. Unwieldy changes in organizational structure do not have to occur to use IMC. The downside of IMC for public relations is a loss of practice autonomy, which coincides with the threat of imperialism."71

The study states, however, "for public relations practitioners to reap the benefits of integration and participate in new practice arenas, fear of imperialism from marketing or advertising may have to be overcome. Imperialism and territorialism are old paradigms. Coordination and collaboration are the new paradigms. The more public relations familiarizes itself with the priorities and challenges of other departments in an organization, the more effective it can become. This results in an informed, comprehensive dialogue between consumers and organizations, which in turn allows the organization to continuously position itself positively."72

71 AEJMC conference papers, Central Michigan university, The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, 1998
72 Ibid
According to the study, “This point parallels the implications for public relations scholars. Just as the public relations practitioner is more effective by considering the big picture of the organization, communication scholars can also benefit greatly from studying IMC from a broader interdisciplinary perspective. Many principles, such as the notion of consumption constellations, were developed for the marketing and advertising community but are valid concepts for review in the communication profession. The rising cost of education has made students more concerned about learning practical applications of public relations alongside of the theory. More and more communication textbooks include chapters on practical applications and career orientation.”  

The study says, “If IMC is a valid tool and part of public relations future, it needs to be integrated into the teaching curriculum. Students not exposed to IMC may be caught unaware when they enter the real world, and they may be conditioned to think narrowly about the scope of PR practice. To prepare students for an IMC work environment, degree programs in public relations should raise the topic as a concept and provide practical skills. Curriculum should include information on the purpose of IMC, models for practice, and case profiles, as well as provide a broad-based knowledge of marketing, advertising and management principles.”

In another study by Wilcox, Ault, Agee and Cameron, they contend, “If the concept of integrating communications is here to stay, how can the next generation of public relations practitioners be educated to work in an environment that has most often been viewed as the domain of advertising and marketing?”

73 Ibid  
74 Ibid  
75 Ibid
The debate surrounding the proposed integration of public relations with advertising and marketing has been well documented. However, Griffin and Pasadeos concluded that "change is here and the communication functions are becoming more integrated."\textsuperscript{76}

The report of a task force on integrated communications by Duncan, Caywood and Newsom in 1993 stated "those entering the fields of public relations and advertising in the 21\textsuperscript{st} century should build stronger relationships between themselves and with marketing." The report concluded, "Advertising and public relations students must be offered a more conceptually unified and integrated program of communication study."	extsuperscript{77}

In a study by Robert A. Carroll, Preparing Public Relations Students for the IMC environment, he states, "During the mid-1990s, data gathered from alumni employment surveys of a mid-western university's graduates showed that most public relations and advertising alumni were finding entry-level jobs in small markets. Anecdotal feedback from alumni showed that many often found themselves in positions that called for the integration of communication skills, as well as marketing knowledge and skills that they were lacking."	extsuperscript{78}

This evidence was supported by Griffin and Pasadeos in their 1998 study which found that both advertising and public relations educators in their study agreed that employers are demanding skills their programs had not covered.

\textsuperscript{76} Ibid
\textsuperscript{77} Ibid
\textsuperscript{78} Robert A. Carroll. University of Southern Indiana, Preparing Public Relations Students for the IMC environment: 1–2.
Using the 1993 IMC task force report for guidance, a three-person team of advertising, public relations, and marketing professors began to explore ways to develop closer ties between their disciplines. One result of this effort was the development of a senior-level IMC course to be offered as an elective in the public relations, advertising, and marketing programs.

**Task Force on Integrated Communications 1993**

In the study conducted by the Task Force on Integrated Communications it was concluded, “Public relations and advertising graduates would be better served by an integrated curriculum that would prepare them to enter the “fast changing media and professional environments.”79

The 1993 study by Duncan, Caywood and Newsom sought to assess the impact that the rapidly changing communications industry may have on the preparation of advertising and public relations majors. The ensuing debate surrounding the proposed integration of public relations, advertising, and marketing has been well documented.

Some public relations educators opposed such a move on the grounds that public relations is not a marketing function, but rather a much broader responsibility that should report directly to the CEO. Furthermore, Griffin and Pasadeos stated “both fields represent distinct roles and are rooted in different philosophies-an issue that complicates their integration into any setting, including the classroom.”80

---

79 Task Force on Integrated Communications, 1993: 10
80 Preparing Advertising and Public Relations Students for the Communications Industry in the 21st Century, A case study, Duncan, Caywood and Newsom, 1993
However, other public relations educators joined their advertising counterparts in embracing the concept. Schultz stated, “The debate about IMC is a moot point because integrated communication is inevitable.”

In their study, Rose and Miller (1993) reported evidence supporting the perceived need for integrated communications by corporations and agencies. “Their research of small market advertising and public relations practitioners has given support to the call for an IMC program to prepare practitioners for work in both areas.”

Scholars in a review of the IMC debate concluded that “public relations clearly plays a valuable role in IMC. One benefit of IMC is that public relations efforts are reinforced by other activities, which improve the opportunities for target audiences to receive and comprehend desired messages from organizations. In the IMC environment, public relations can gain prominence in all customer-based communications.”

The negative implications of IMC for public relations reported by the study included “a loss of autonomy.” The study states that “however, those working in public relations must familiarize themselves with priorities and challenges in other departments to become more effective within an organization.”

Caywood and Ewing found in their 1991 study that “public relations and advertising graduates often found employment in corporations where they worked in an integrated environment.” Their conclusions were supported by the findings of the midwestern university that was the subject of Task force study. They believe, “Analysis of survey data, as well as anecdotal evidence from the university’s public relations and

81 Ibid
82 Ibid
83 Ibid
84 Ibid

...
advertising alumni, showed that many were working in positions that called for the integration of communication skills—as well as marketing knowledge and skills—that some felt they were lacking.”

IMC Study 1995

The IMC study 1995 is based on the feedback from the graduates and with the 1993 Task Force report, members of the advertising and public relations faculty at the university which was the focus of this case study began to seek ways to better prepare their graduates for the changing job market. A committee was formed in 1995 with representatives from the advertising, public relations, and marketing programs to study possible solutions for preparing its graduates for the job market of the 21st century. The committee began its work by reviewing the findings and recommendations of the Task Force on Integrated Communications.

The group agreed with the report’s philosophy that integrating advertising, public relations, and marketing curricula would allow students studying in these interrelated areas to have “a more conceptually unified and integrated program of communication study.” They also studied the Task Force’s recommended curriculum, which focused on a strong liberal arts background (see Table 1). The committee concluded that the university satisfied that recommendation.

Through its CORE curriculum, the university required all students to complete a 48-hour liberal arts and sciences concentration with courses in English, speech, mathematics, philosophy, the arts, history, economics, sociology, psychology, sciences, humanities or foreign languages. In addition, the mass communications programs

85 Ibid
86 Ibid
required an additional 17 hours in arts in sciences to meet the 65-hour requirement of the Accrediting Council on Education in Journalism and Mass Communication. The researcher has tabulated the 1995 Task Force’s proposed integrated communication curriculum below.

Table 1

Task Force's Proposed Integrated Communication Curriculum

1. Strong emphasis on liberal arts
2. Training in oral, written, and visual communication
3. A solid understanding of business and complex organization objectives and practices.
4. An understanding of, and respect for, all of the major communication functions (advertising, direct response, event sponsorship, packaging, public relations, sales, promotion, etc.)
5. A mastery of basic research skills to give insight into problem-solving techniques and strategies

According to the Task Force, 1995, “The advertising and public relations majors were housed in an interdisciplinary Department of Communications, which offered a variety of courses, that met the verbal, written, and visual communication recommendations (point 2) of the Task Force report. Students also gained an overview of the major communications functions (point 4) and were offered a course in mass communications research (point 5). Courses were identified in the School of Business that students in advertising and public relations could take without the prerequisites
required of business majors. These courses typically included courses in management and marketing (point 3).”\textsuperscript{87}

At the same time, courses in advertising and public relations were identified that marketing students could take without prerequisites by the Task Force Committee. The committee also sought a way in which students from the three disciplines might share a common experience. From that study emerged a senior-level Integrated Marketing Communications course to be offered as an elective in the public relations, advertising, and marketing curricula. A study also began on the possibility of merging the public relations and advertising programs into an \textit{integrated} major.

\textbf{Designing the IMC course}

The Committee’s primary goal of the new IMC course was to create among students an understanding of how public relations, advertising and marketing interests work together to achieve organizational objectives. Task Force Study, 1995, reported “The end result of the course was an integrated marketing communications campaign plan for selected local and area clients. The professors developed a course syllabus, which had undergone several changes as the team explored new ideas and learned from their experiences. Students enrolling in the class must have had introductory courses in marketing, and public relations or advertising, and be at least a junior. Therefore, most students come into the class after having completed most of their major discipline courses.”\textsuperscript{88}

\textsuperscript{87} Task Force Study Report, 1995  
\textsuperscript{88} Ibid
According to this report, "The Integrated Marketing Communications course was cross-listed in the advertising, public relations, and marketing sequences. Various teaching methods were explored, including team teaching. Only one professor could count the course in his/her teaching load for the semester; therefore, it was agreed that the three would rotate the course, counting it as a part of each professor’s teaching load every third year. The other two would volunteer to make guest lectures in the course. The 15-week course begins with an overview and introduction of the IMC concept and relationship marketing by the lead instructor. The topics then moved into marketing concepts with an emphasis on the marketing communication process."91

“Sessions on personal selling, advertising, promotions, special events, public relations, and direct marketing were divided among the three professors as to their areas of expertise. The two guest lecturers each spent two weeks going over their areas with the class. They also prepared and graded examinations over their topics,” reports the Task Force Study 1995.90

The Task Force Study, 1995, also discusses the concern that some public relations educators had about public relations being encroached upon by marketing; the public relations faculty member used two approaches to the public relations presentation.

The study first emphasizes the holistic concept of public relations. It discusses the "Traditional functions of public relations—counseling management, public opinion research, media relations, publicity, employee relations, community relations, public affairs, issues management, crisis communications, and financial relations."91 These

89 Ibid
90 Ibid
91 Ibid
topics served as a review for the public relations majors who were exposed to these concepts in several of the courses they take but were new for most of the advertising majors in the class.

The study reports that once the broader role of public relations was established, attention turned to the function of public relations in marketing communications. “A variety of cases were used to demonstrate how public relations is effectively used to support both organizational and marketing objectives. Students were selected at random from each discipline and placed into small teams to begin preparing an IMC campaign plan book for their clients. The students then arranged meetings with their clients to gain an understanding of the challenges that need to be addressed. The work was conducted pro bono for the clients as the projects were considered by the faculty to be learning experiences for the students,” according to the Task Force Study Report, 1995.  

Task Force Study Report, 1995 also talks about a plan book that contained a detailed IMC campaign outline, together with appropriate examples for each communications tactic was chosen to reach the organization’s marketing objectives. “During the last week of class, the students made in-class presentations and presented the IMC campaign plan books to their clients. Students received peer evaluations from other team members for their individual contributions to the project. This evaluation became a part of their grade. The three professors individually evaluated the campaign plan books and determined an appropriate grade for the project,” reports the Task Force Study, 1995.

92 Ibid
93 Ibid
Developing an integrated curriculum

The Task Force Study Report, 1993, stated, “Students might be better served by being allowed the option of studying across marketing and corporate communication disciplines as well as specializing in advertising or public relations. The study stated that the advertising and public relations specialties will not disappear, but the distinctions between the fields may be blurred for practical, as well as professional, reasons.”

Two conceptual models for developing an integrated curriculum (see Table 2) were recommended in the Task Force report (1993).

According to the Task Force Study Report, 1993, “The first model offered a broad set of subject areas that are modular and are often contained in existing courses in public relations and advertising programs. The three subject areas, each with several modules, include personal development, professional development and integration. The second model was more course-specific and provided course titles for an integrated sequence. This model included a survey/overview course, research and analysis, communication skills, and application areas.” The two models are presented below.

Table 2 Two Conceptual Models of Integrated Curriculum

Model I: Integrated Modular Approach

1. Personal Development: Writing for communications, problem solving, visual literacy, quantitative and qualitative research skills, and presentation skills

94 Task Force Study Report, 1993: 19
95 Ibid
2. Professional Development: Audience insight, business understanding, strategy development, “media” understanding, law and ethics, people management, research methodology, issues and trend identification, and analysis, targeting, and segmentation

3. Integration: Multi-disciplinary basic training, measurement and evaluation, and communication mix management.

Model II: Integrated Course Approach

1. Survey of Integrated Communication: A course similar to the introductory courses in advertising and public relations. The course would stress strategic planning for integrated communication. Students would gain exposure to a full range of advertising and public relations principles as well as the concept of integrated communication.

2. Stakeholder and Customer Behavior: Publics/audiences and organizational behavior, segmentation, and targeting, databases and research methodology (topics often covered in advertising, public relations, and marketing principles courses)

3. Organizational Analysis: Covers quantitative analysis of sales and share data, nonprofit organization’s standing, ability to secure resources (time and money), research methodology including qualitative measures, logistics and budgeting, and relationship between communication and operations and production areas

4. Persuasive Communication: Message effectiveness, psychology and strategy of attitude and behavior change, and conflict resolution to build and maintain organizational relationships with customers and other stakeholders

5. Message Strategy and Design: Fundamentals of planning and executing oral, written, and visual communication
6. **Message Delivery and Evaluation:** Combining media components of current advertising and public relations courses. Focus on stakeholder contact points, analysis of strengths and weaknesses of various ways of reaching stakeholders, cost/value comparisons of media delivery systems.

7. **Campaigns:** Hands-on assignment requiring students to plan and execute a fully integrated communication campaign, making use of all the major communication functions.

8. **Internship:** Student experience with organizations that demonstrated an understanding and practice of some level of integrated communication.

According to the Task Force Study Report, 1993, "Some educators were questioning whether advertising and public relations programs were falling behind professional expectations. They stated that efforts are being made to determine at what level the integrated approach should be taught—undergraduate or graduate. Also, public relations and advertising were being combined to represent the interrelationship between the fields and/or to more effectively utilize the talents and services of the respective faculty."\(^{96}\)

Using the Task Force Study Report, 1993, other literature in the field, and information from its advertising and public relations graduates, University of Southern Indiana, which is the focus of the AEJMC Conference paper, Preparing Public Relations and Advertising Students for the 21st Century: A Case Study, 2001, set out in the mid-1990s to find ways in which it could better prepare graduates for the changing demands of the communications industry.

\(^{96}\) Ibid
University of Southern Indiana conducted an annual survey of all of its graduates each year to determine, among other things, the types of jobs which alumni had obtained and brief job descriptions. “Approximately 60% of the advertising and public relations graduates responded to the annual requests for data. Surveys of the advertising and public relations graduates during the last couple of years since the IMC course was first offered (1996) showed that alumni from both programs often took similar positions. This data closely paralleled earlier studies when the university was tracking its graduates prior to implementation of the IMC course.”

According to the AEJMC Conference paper - Preparing Public Relations and Advertising Students for the 21st Century: A Case Study, 2001, “The increasingly close ties between public relations and advertising with marketing became very obvious when the data was analyzed: more than one-fourth of advertising graduates (29%) went into positions which they described as marketing while almost half (48%) of public relations graduates entered marketing positions. Other analysis of the survey data revealed that about one-fifth of advertising (19%) and public relations graduates (22%) entered work in agencies or firms with job descriptions of account executives. About three-fourths (76%) of advertising graduates were working in corporate offices of various types, while about two-thirds (61%) of public relations graduates were employed in corporate environments. Public relations graduates were much more likely to go into not-for-profit environments (22%) as compared to their advertising counterparts (5%).”

The researcher has tabulated the data below.

---

98 Ibid
Table 3

1996-99 Advertising & Public Relations Graduate Employer Survey

Types of employers for 100 Advertising and Public Relations Grads

1. Percentage of Advertising Grads – Corporate 76, Agencies/Firms 19, Not-for-profits 5

2. Percentage of Public Relations Grads – Corporate 61, Agencies/Firms 17, Not-for-profits 22

Note: Survey results did not include those who reported jobs that were not in advertising or public relations fields. Only about 60% of advertising and public relations students graduating during the 1996-99 period responded to the survey.

Table 4

1996-99 Advertising & Public Relations Graduate Job Description Survey

Job Description of 100 Advertising and Public Relations Grads

1. Percentage of Advertising Grads - Marketing 29, Account Executive 19, Graphic Designer 19, Promotions 14, Media Buyer 5, Customer Service 5, Copywriter 5, Communications 5, Recruitment 0, Fundraising 0

2. Percentage of Public Relations Grads - Marketing 48, Account Executive 22, Graphic Designer 0, Promotions 5, Media Buyer 5, Customer Service 5, Copywriter 0, Communications 5, Recruitment 5, Fundraising 5
Note: Survey results did not include those who reported jobs that were not in advertising or public relations fields. Only about 60% of advertising and public relations students graduating during the 1996-99 period responded to the survey.

Conclusions

That study resulted in bridging the gap among the advertising, public relations, and marketing faculty. As per the AEJMC Conference paper - Preparing Public Relations and Advertising Students for the 21st Century: A Case Study, 2001, “A new senior-level course, Integrated Marketing Communications, was designed for majors in all three areas to learn how to work together in designing an IMC campaign plan to reach organizational objectives. Another development has been the merging of the advertising and public relations curricula into a new program that allows students greater flexibility in preparing for their careers. The university will continue to track its advertising and public relations graduates each year to determine if what is being done meets the needs of the changing marketplace.”

99 Ibid
Chapter 3
Research Design

Integrated Marketing Communications has an impact on the field of public relations. The researcher viewed Integrated Marketing Communications through the lens of the Public Relations educators and scholars to determine whether IMC is beneficial or detrimental to the field of public relations.

Public Relations educators and scholars play an important role in PR education; the researcher looks at the implications of Integrated Marketing Communications on public relations education using both qualitative and quantitative research methods. The researcher will test the following hypothesis.

H#1 Eighty percent or more of public relations educators surveyed view IMC as a positive response to the demands of changing markets. They believe IMC is critical to comprehensive public relations program.

H # 2 Twenty percent educators opine that an IMC based curricula may undermine the educator's ability to provide in-depth knowledge, leaving students ill prepared for current practice.

Specific Objectives of the study

Objective # 1 To understand if PR educators view IMC as beneficial or detrimental to the field of public relations.

Objective # 2 To research the Implications of IMC on public relations education.
Methods of Data Collection -

To test this thesis' hypotheses, the researcher used qualitative research in the form of interviews with 15 IMC specialists who have a public relations background. The researcher used an informal method for selecting the sample. The researcher pulled out the sample based on her secondary research and chose people with significant contribution to the IMC field. The researcher used email surveys to gain an in-depth understanding of the educators’ point of view on IMC and their perceptions of its implications on public relations education.

The researcher designed a specific set of questions that were standardized – all 15 respondents were asked the same questions. The email survey was highly effective because the researcher's own opinions did not influence the respondent to answer questions in a certain manner. There were no verbal or visual clues to influence the respondent.

This method of data collection was less intrusive than telephone or face-to-face surveys. The respondents were free to complete the survey on their own time-table. Besides being cost effective, email surveys were easy to analyze.

In addition, the researcher conducted a formal quantitative content analysis of the curricula of 13 graduate programs in public relations to determine if other marketing elements such as direct marketing, advertising and sales promotion are included in the coursework. For the purpose of conducting this content analysis, the researcher first clearly formulated the categories that were well adapted to study the coursework of the graduate programs. All categories were mutually exclusive, exhaustive, and reliable. Each unit of analysis could be placed in only one category. There were existing slots for
every unit of analysis. The researcher was careful not to create too many or too few
categories to facilitate the coding process.

To report the findings from the content analysis, the researcher used intercoder
reliability tests with the help of three of her fellow researchers.

The researcher then compared the data obtained to an IMC model developed by
W. Glenn Griffin and Yorgo Pasadeos for a study on “The Impact of IMC on Advertising
and Public Relations Education.”

This comparative study enabled the researcher to study the current trends in
public relations education and report the implications of IMC on the coursework of the
programs. The researcher used the Internet as a tool to get information on the graduate
coursework of different universities.

Several study design restrictions were included in this study. Because both
qualitative and quantitative research techniques depend on the time in which they are
implemented, respondents often neglect to give adequate responses. Public Relations
educators and scholars can only recommend general guidelines based on the data.
However, for the purpose of this study, the researcher assumed that the same outcomes
presented here will prevail in other times.
Chapter 4
Survey

Of 15 mailed questionnaires, 5 were returned (a 33.3 % response rate). Each of the 15 public relations educators received a 5-item mail survey exploring integration of communication activities in an IMC model as beneficial or detrimental to the profession of public relations. Other questions explored relevant issues to the research study such as determining a need for an overhaul of public relations education in light of the IMC trend in the communications and special skills or background professionals teaching in an IMC model need to have in order to create an ideal learning environment.

While four public relations educators believe that IMC is beneficial to the public relations profession, they reported that educators today are faced with a challenge to make public relations education wider in scope to include the integration of various communication activities to make public relations education relevant to current business practices. These believers in IMC unanimously agree that all public relations educators must have exposure to the real business and corporate public relations environment before they gain entry to the academics side of the business. One of the educators who oppose the concept of integration believes that it should not be taught at all as it is detrimental to the education of public relations.
Four of the educators believe that public relations education will evolve naturally to become more relevant to the real world practice with hiring of more educators from an integrated background who will communicate the benefits of IMC to their students and also develop the curricula to suit changes in the market place. All respondents agree that public relations education in the future should be developed keeping in mind the importance of the discipline as a management function. Therefore, the curricula used at the university level must aim at arming future practitioners with skills necessary to operate in the ever-changing business world.

To facilitate better understanding of the study, responses to the questionnaire are noted below -

1. Do you view the integration of communication activities in an IMC model as beneficial or detrimental to the profession of public relations? Why or why not. Please expand.

   Respondent 1. Respondent believes that IMC, better known as synergy, is a must and it is rare for objectives and goals to be met without achieving it.

   Respondent 2. Respondent opines that public relations has already morphed into IMC. He believes that addressing public relations as a separate discipline is at best, naïve. There is little demand for the traditional practitioner in the market place and management today wants someone with expanded skills, thus, elevating the practitioner in the eyes of his/her clients with integration of communication activities.

   Respondent 3. Respondent also believes that integration is beneficial especially since public relations can take even more of a leadership role in corporations with Corporate Branding (reputation) and providing tactical leadership to the Strategic Business Units.
According to the respondent, labeling of public relations as a profession may not be helpful in this case since marketing, finance and human resources are not really professions. Public relations professionals need to part of the main line management.

Respondent 4. Respondent believes that public relations will become much more useful as it becomes more integrated into the mix of disciplines in the IMC model. The IMC discipline will help create an environment where public relations professionals routinely measure their programs in terms of behavioral outcomes. The IMC discipline will help direct public relations efforts at true marketing objectives rather than more diffuse goals. Combined with the Reputation Management paradigm, which is the perception of how the actions of an organization is perceived by its stakeholders, the IMC discipline will create a more widely shared view of appropriate goals and objectives. In many cases, Public Relations will be the central element in the IMC mix because of its ability to produce attitude change at a reasonable cost.

Respondent 5. Respondent opposes the concept of IMC. She opines that IMC is mostly an advertising idea applied to public relations. She states that public relations in a very superficial way and essentially reduces public relations to a technical support function for marketing. It limits public relations to one public, the consumer. And it applies marketing ideas to an area where they do not work: public relations. She views public relations as a strategic management function that has much greater importance than providing media messages to supplement advertising.

2. Is there a need for overhaul in public relations education in light of the IMC trend in the communication business? Why or why not. Please expand.

Respondent 1 says that the need for overhaul in public relations education in light of the
IMC trend in the communication business depends on who is teaching it. He teaches public relations to his students by stressing the relationship it has to IMC.

Respondent 2 says that the public relations education is due for an overhaul. He stresses that more writing and journalism courses need to be included as opposed to the current tendency to include several courses in communication theory and planning.

Respondent 3 is certain of the need to change the way public relations is taught in classrooms across universities. He says that educators need to educate students to make them more marketable. He observes that public relations students earned $40K at age 25 in 1992 and in 2004 they earn $75K as IMC/PR managers with technical competency in databases.

Respondent 4 believes that the public relations education needs to be reformulated because currently it is taught simply as a form of journalism for hire. It is imperative that public relations is seen as a form of management consulting, therefore it should be integrated with other disciplines.

Respondent 5 thinks that there is a need to explain IMC to public relations students to sensitize them to the problem and to prepare them to resist the idea when they are faced with it.

3. What special skills or background do you feel that professions teaching in an IMC model need to have in order to create an ideal learning environment? Please Expand.

Respondent 1 says that in order to create an ideal learning environment, not only should professionals know the ins and outs of IMC, or as Ogilvy calls it 360 degree marketing, but they should have practiced it and practiced it successfully.
Respondent 2 stresses that public relations educators must have at least 20 years experience in a profit setting ---10 years in a senior capacity because academicians without real world experience are a feckless lot, even if they have excellent didactic skills. He compares such academicians to captains who know all about the nautical science, yet have never been to the sea.

Respondent 3 believes that each professional needs a highly relevant technical advantage. Educators need to know the AI applications to public relations and media measurement. They must know applied statistics (not pre-PhD. stats) and they must have client experience at a corporate level.

Respondent 4 opines that business experience outside the academic environment is the critical credential. Experience doing public relations in a context of measured results, expressed as behavioral outcomes must become the standard. Ability to operate effectively in the Internet environment becomes a necessary minimum standard as well.

Respondent 5 opposes teaching of integrated marketing communication in the public relations discipline.

4. What changes, if any, do you anticipate in a traditional public relations education in light of the trend toward IMC? Please expand.

Respondent 1 believes that more programs will have to implement IMC courses as related to public relations in the future to make public relations education relevant to the current practice.

Respondent 2 views development of curricula to the demands of the market place as a natural progression once the educators start teaching public relations keeping in mind the
real world applications.

Respondent 3 expects radical changes with joint degrees in the future and hiring of Ph.Ds in management and marketing.

Respondent 5 believes that the public relations education needs to teach the students about the detrimental impact of IMC to the public relations education.

5. Please give any further thoughts on the state of public relations education now and in the future.

Respondent 1 believes public relations to be part of our everyday lives. He thinks it is up to professionals to communicate the importance of public relations in nearly every aspect. Education leads to knowledge, which leads to attitude, which leads to opinion formation, which equals output. If output achieves the outcome one desires, synergy has been achieved and so has the goal.

Respondent 2 talks about public relations education five years back as taught in his university without the IMC course. But today there are several integrated courses offered and sees IMC as becoming an indelible part of the curriculum in the future.

Respondent 4 views teaching of a media relations model that refers to a media environment as a significant limitation on the usefulness of public relations education because the media environment no longer exists.

Respondent 5 considers public relations as a management function that requires courses as public relations theory, strategic management, research, and an "apprenticeship" in the form of internship. Writing, of course, is a fundamental skill that must be studied. A public relations student needs to understand how to communicate with ALL of the
organization's strategic publics—not just customers or consumers, as is the emphasis in marketing communication. Instead, in public relations there must be understanding of the legitimate concerns of our employees, our community, the media, shareholders, customers, suppliers, competitors, and—especially—any activist groups that may be pressuring the organization.

Content Analysis

The researcher conducted a formal quantitative content analysis of the curricula of 13 graduate programs in public relations to determine if "other" marketing elements such as direct marketing, advertising and sales promotion are included in the coursework. The researcher compared the data to an IMC model developed by W. Glenn Griffin and Yorgo Pasadeos for a study on “The Impact of IMC on Advertising and Public Relations Education.” The researcher used this model as a guide in completing the content analysis.

Model for an Integrated Curriculum

Integrated Modular Approach (Topical)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Personal Development</th>
<th>Writing for communications, problem solving, visual literacy, quantitative and qualitative research skills, and</th>
<th>Of 13 graduate programs studied for the purpose of this study, nearly 85 percent programs included courses that lead toward personal</th>
<th>The graduate programs to include these courses are - Rowan University, Syracuse University, University of Florida, University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

57
| 2. Professional Development | Audience Insight, business understanding, strategy development, “media” understanding, law and ethics, people | Of 13 graduate programs studied for the purpose of this study, 83 percent programs included courses that satisfy professional development in light of an integrated curriculum. | Of California (Fullerton), University of Southern California, Michigan State University, University of Miami, University of Maryland, Boston University, University of Denver and University of Southern Mississippi |
3. Integration

| Multi-disciplinary basic training, measurement and evaluation, and communication mix management. | Of 13 graduate programs studied for the purpose of this study, nearly 85 percent programs included integrated courses in their curricula. | The graduate programs to include these courses are - Rowan University, Syracuse University, University of Florida, University of California (Fullerton), University of Southern California, Michigan State University, University of Maryland, Boston University, University of Denver and University of Southern Mississippi. |
| (Fullerton), University of Southern California, Michigan State University, University of Miami, University of Maryland, Boston University, University of Denver and University of Southern Mississippi |
Chapter 5

Results

Limitations of the study

This study examined whether leading public educators and scholars view IMC as beneficial or detrimental to the field of public relations. The study relied only on the responses of PR educators and scholars. Therefore, the results will not include opinion of practicing PR professionals.

The study did not include PR practitioners who may be a very important source of information for understanding the practical application of IMC and its impact on public relations practice.

The study was limited to those people who are related to the teaching of public relations and the views held by faculty members in the Public Relations Department at the university level. The researcher is unable to account for any opinions of professors in other departments including advertising and marketing.

Hypotheses –

H#1 Eighty percent public relations educators surveyed believe IMC is critical to comprehensive public relations program. The study supports this hypothesis showing 80 percent public relations educators believe that IMC is beneficial to the public relations profession. They are aware that educators today are faced with a challenge to make
public relations education wider in scope to include the integration of various communication activities to make public relations education relevant to current business practices.

H#2 Twenty percent educators opine that an IMC based curricula may undermine the educator's ability to provide in-depth knowledge, leaving students ill prepared for current practice. The study supports this hypothesis showing that 20 percent of the educators who oppose the concept of integration believe that it should not be taught at all, as it defeats the purpose of teaching public relations specialization at the university level.

Possible new directions for public relations educators and scholars

Many research studies have reviewed the scholarly debate and professional experiences with IMC from an interdisciplinary perspective and its impact on other disciplines such as public relations. IMC has been defined in many ways; it is generally recognized as a holistic system. One of the studies showed that from the public relations perspective, imperialism and new opportunities for practice are dominant features.

Viewpoints from the communication, advertising, and marketing professions during my secondary research indicated that public relations practice makes many contributions to marketing objectives. Similarly, public relations may benefit from collaboration with the business professions by adopting certain techniques and by venturing into new areas of practice.

Rather than providing definitive answers in this study, the implications of IMC on public relations education raise important issues for future discussion and research. For further study on this subject matter, it will be interesting to include public relations
practitioners in the scope of research to understand practical applications of the IMC concept. In addition, including professors from other departments such as advertising and marketing would prove to be valuable sources to gain insight into the IMC implications on other disciplines.
References

AEJMC conference paper, The Interdisciplinary debate over IMC, 1998

AEJMC conference paper, The Interdisciplinary debate over IMC, 1998

AEJMC conference papers, Central Michigan University - The Interdisciplinary Debate Over IMC: Implications for PR Practitioners, Scholars and Educators, 1998

Belch G. and Belch M- Public relations, publicity, and corporate advertising. In Introduction to advertising and promotion-3rd edition, p. 516-547), 1995

Carroll A. Robert, University of Southern Indiana, Preparing Public Relations Students for the IMC environment, p.1–2.


Lawrence J- Advertising Age. Integrated mix makes expansion fly: PR program leads Southwest foray into east coast, 64, S-10, November 8, 1993


Preparing Advertising and Public Relations Students for the Communications Industry in the 21st Century, A case study, Duncan, Caywood and Newsom, 1993

Schultz D-Integrated marketing communications: Maybe definition is in the point of View, Marketing News, p.17, January 18,1993


Stewart D- Market-back approach to the design of integrated communications program: a change in paradigm and focus on determinants of success. Journal of Business Research, 150, 1996

Task Force on Integrated Communications, p.10, 1993

Task Force on Integrated Communications, p. 19, 1993

Task Force on Integrated Communications, p. 20-21, 1993

Warner C- Public Relations Journal, Applying integrated marketing to brand positioning. p.48(10), 15-16, 1992

www.imcomm.net
APPENDIX A

Five-item Questionnaire

1. Do you view the integration of communication activities in an IMC model as beneficial or detrimental to the profession of public relations? Why or why not. Please expand.

2. Is there a need for overhaul in public relations education in light of the IMC trend in the communication business? Why or why not. Please expand.

3. What special skills or background do you feel that professions teaching in a IMC model need to have in order to create an ideal learning environment? Please Expand.

4. What changes, if any, do you anticipate in a traditional public relations education in light of the trend toward IMC? Please expand.

5. Please give any further thoughts on the state of public relations education now and in the future
## Model For An Integrated Curriculum

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Integrated Modular Approach (Topical)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### 1. Personal Development

Writing for communications, problem solving, visual literacy, quantitative and qualitative research skills, and presentation skills.

### 2. Professional Development

Audience Insight, business understanding, strategy development, “media” understanding, law and ethics, people management, research methodology, issues and trend identification and analysis, targeting, and segmenting

### 3. Integration

Multi-disciplinary basic training, measurement and evaluation, and communication mix management.